Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family

Sector selection based on the Cyclically Adjusted Price Earnings (CAPE™) Ratio


Robert Shiller has partnered with Barclays to jointly develop the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family. Robert Shiller is a Yale professor, author of numerous books including the New York Times best seller “Irrational Exuberance,” and was jointly responsible for developing the Standard & Poor’s/Case-Shiller Home Price Indices.

After a year-long collaboration the result is the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family. These equity indices utilize the Cyclically Adjusted PE Ratio (CAPE) as a key driver to identify undervalued US sectors.

Robert Shiller and John Campbell originally devised the CAPE ratio in their paper “Stock Prices, Earnings and Expected Dividends” (1988). The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family offers US equity market exposure with a value bias and is intended for buy and hold investors with a multi-year time horizon – within this framework they may provide attractive long-term returns for investors. Other variations and European versions will be available too.

This paper highlights the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family methodology that selects value sectors based on the Relative CAPE indicator and uses momentum to eliminate value traps. Rebalancing monthly, the three indices in the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family outperform benchmarks with improved annualized returns, lower volatility and better risk profiles. This analysis builds on 40 years of sector-level return and earnings information, which has been made possible by the use of firm-level data and aggregating these into sector-level quantities.

Value investing has a long tradition in the investment management community and plays a prominent role in the academic finance literature as an outgrowth of the analysis of market (in)efficiency. Within the realm of academic finance, its origins can be traced back to the work of Basu (1977), Fama and French (1992), and Lakonishok, Shleifer, and Vishny (1994). Traditional valuation measures relate market variables to balance sheet variables (e.g., the Book-to-Price ratio) or market variables to income statement variables (e.g., the Price-Earnings (PE) ratio).

A problematic aspect of the PE ratio for investors with a medium-/long-term focus is its reliance on earnings information from only the past year. One-year earnings tend to provide noisy signals, which are influenced by the business cycle. While this information can be useful for investors with a short investment horizon as it incorporates the most up-to-date trends, the noise of this signal increases with the investment horizon.

The Cyclically Adjusted Price Earnings (CAPE) ratio addresses this concern by using an average of longer-term earnings. Instead of using earnings over just the past 12 months, it is a ratio of current price to an average of inflation-adjusted earnings over the past 10 years. This long-term focus motivates the use of the term “cyclically adjusted”, as it exceeds the length of most business cycles. It makes the ratio suited for detecting long-term over- and under-valuations in the stock market, making it more informative for investors with a long-term focus.

The CAPE ratio was formally devised by Campbell and Shiller (1988) and has been widely used as a valuation tool for the overall stock market. Analogous to the much referenced PE ratio, the intuition behind the CAPE ratio is that low ratios generally indicate high future market returns and high ratios provide an overall contraction signal. Figure 1 shows the historical CAPE ratios at each quarter-end going back to the 1880s for the overall stock market (as measured by the S&P 500 Index) with corresponding subsequent 10-year returns of this market index. In line with the intuition, there is a strongly negative correlation (-55%) between the CAPE ratio and subsequent long-term returns, indicating that the CAPE ratio provides useful information about the subsequent long-term performance of the stock market.

FIGURE 1: The CAPE Ratio of the US Stock Market in Relation to Subsequent Annualized 10-Year Real Total Returns from 1882 until 2012

Source: Barclays Research
Using a stock universe of the largest 500 companies in the US (the universe is reset every month), this paper constructs a 40-year dataset of returns and earnings for the 10 sectors in the S&P Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS). After the creation of 40 years worth of data, the same strong negative correlation exists between the Sector CAPE ratio and subsequent long-term sector returns. Figure 2 illustrates the predictive ability of CAPE for the GICS sectors of Consumer Staples and Materials. It should be noted that the historical time period used for the sector analysis in Figure 2 is substantially shorter than that of Figure 1, 30 years instead of 130 years. In order to ensure statistical significance in our analysis for the sectors, we limit the return horizon to two years which allows us to use 15 non-overlapping periods, in line with the analysis for the overall market in Figure 1. Otherwise one might encounter spurious relationships between the predictor variable and subsequent returns.

Note: See Bunn and Shiller (2012) for further details about this plot. Source: Cowles (1939), S&P Security Price Index Record (Various Volumes), S&P Analysts; Handbook (Various Volumes) Note the Index utilizes the tradable versions of the GICS sectors, where Telecommunications and Information Technology have been combined.

What we note in Figure 2 is in line with the above evidence for the overall market, as lower values of CAPE are generally associated with higher future returns and higher values of CAPE indicate lower future returns. Building on these initial findings on the predictive power of CAPE for long-term sector returns, we have developed the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family that systematically selects the favorable – undervalued – sectors based on the CAPE ratio. It is important to note that these indices are based on the relative valuation of sectors and translates these assessments into an allocation, which is fundamentally different from an approach based on market timing.

Before turning our attention to the indices, it is necessary to take a more detailed look at the evolution of the CAPE ratio across different sectors. As an example, Figure 3 depicts the CAPE ratio for the Industrials and the Utilities sectors. Whereas the Industrials sector is being considered a rather typical cyclical sector, the Utilities sector is a good example for a defensive sector. Accordingly, the CAPE ratio for the Industrials sector is substantially more volatile than that of the Utilities. However, not only does the volatility of the CAPE ratio vary between the two sectors, but they also appear to be fluctuating at different levels.

Fundamental valuation ratios, such as the CAPE ratio, are potentially difficult to compare across different sectors for a variety of reasons, including different levels of maturity and, accordingly, different growth prospects for the sectors, regulations and varying accounting standards. For example the Utilities sector typically trades at a relatively low CAPE, while the Information Technology sector trades at a relatively higher CAPE ratio. Thus, if one just examined and selected a sector out of these two based only on the CAPE ratio, one would repeatedly choose Utilities almost all the time. Hence, to make the CAPE ratio more comparable across
sectors, this paper introduces a standardization of it, the Relative CAPE indicator. To compute this indicator, we divide a sector’s CAPE ratio at a given point in time by the 20-year historical average of this sector’s CAPE ratio (numbers used for this average are winsorized* at the 5% level). The CAPE Ratio here uses total return prices with the objective of eliminating the effects of corporate payout policy, which was a criticism of the original CAPE Ratio.

Note:* Winsorizing is used to smooth any outlying values that may distort the signal as 20 years of values are used.

It is this Relative CAPE indicator that rests at the core of the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family. Each month, the index selects the five sectors with the lowest values of the Relative CAPE indicator, i.e., the sectors that are the most undervalued according to the indicator. Only four of these five sectors, however, end up in the final portfolio for a given month, as the sector with the worst 12-month momentum among the five selected sectors is eliminated. This momentum filter, identifying the sector with the worst market sentiment in recent history, helps us in addressing the so-called “value traps”, a key theme in value investing. The “value trap” occurs when a stock or sector may appear to be cheap and attracts investors because the stock or sector seems inexpensive. The trap springs when investors purchase a stock or sector and it takes a significant amount of time to improve, if ever.

Graphically this is represented as follows:

FIGURE 4: CAPE-Based Sector Selection Strategy

Start from the 10 sectors
Select 5 sectors with low values of the Relative CAPE indicator
Eliminate 1 of the 5 selected sectors with the worst momentum
4 undervalued sectors with best relative momentum remain. Used in 3 indices

Source: Barclays Research

Based on this methodology Barclays, in collaboration with Professor Shiller, has created three tradable indices. The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Sector Index takes an equal weighted long position in each of four favored sectors that are undervalued and possess relatively stronger price momentum over the past 12 months. The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Sector Tilted Index overweight the four favored US sectors and underweights the rest of the sectors, based on their market capitalization weights. The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Sector Market Hedged Index takes a long position in the four favored US sectors and a short position on the market benchmark according to the weighted beta of the four favored sectors.

Figure 5 summarizes the historical performance the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family. The first extension is a beta-hedged version, which is designed to extract excess returns over the market while targeting market neutrality. As we can see, this version delivers an attractive Return/Risk ratio along with a relatively low maximum drawdown and low correlation with the S&P 500 Total Return index. The second extension aims at closely tracking the market benchmark while tilting the weights of the sectors away from their market weights as a function of the CAPE-based selection of sectors. This strategy generates returns that are more than 95% correlated with the market benchmark over the historic period analysed. Crucially, this strategy outperforms the market, in line with the core CAPE-based sector selection strategy, as evidenced by an excess 17% in its information ratio.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CAPE US Sector Index</th>
<th>CAPE US Sector Market Hedged Index</th>
<th>CAPE US Sector Tilted Index</th>
<th>S&amp;P 500 TR Index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annualized Return</td>
<td>11.70%</td>
<td>6.46%</td>
<td>8.72%</td>
<td>7.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annualized Volatility</td>
<td>20.18%</td>
<td>5.54%</td>
<td>19.89%</td>
<td>21.24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return/Volatility</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum Drawdown</td>
<td>-43.54%</td>
<td>-9.55%</td>
<td>-47.84%</td>
<td>-55.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlation with SPTR</td>
<td>94.54%</td>
<td>14.69%</td>
<td>98.54%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Barclays Research
In summary, the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family aims to achieve consistent outperformance in the long-term, allowing for short-term instances of underperformance against the benchmark.

At its very core, the CAPE ratio and Relative CAPE indicator are value indicators that take a long-term view of the sectors. During the 1990s, this focus led the strategy to identify the information technology sector – the crucial driver of the run-up to the technology bubble. As a result, the strategy took a defensive stance against the technology bubble early on, which ultimately led to its outperformance after the bubble burst. By its very nature, the run-up to the technology bubble was driven by the outperformance of growth stocks, which necessarily disadvantaged value-based investment approaches. This period brings about the most substantial underperformance of the CAPE-based sector selection versus the market benchmark. The underperformance before the burst of the technology bubble is followed by the most dramatic outperformance period.

The indices have a variety of uses, namely the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Sector Index may be used in a portfolio as a replacement/complement for a sector rotation strategy, or as a substitute for a value allocation or in a contrarian alpha portfolio. The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Tilted Index may be used in a portfolio as a replacement for US equity exposure, as it is designed to closely track the S&P 500. Finally the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Market Hedged Index may be used in a portfolio as a replacement/complement for a long-term equity market neutral portfolio or for investors seeking access to the value risk premia.

Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family

The Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family has been developed in part by RSBB, LLC, the research principal of which is Robert J. Shiller. RSBB, LLC is not an investment advisor and does not guarantee the accuracy and completeness of the Shiller Barclays CAPE US Index Family or any data or methodology included therein or upon which it is based. RSBB, LLC shall have no liability for any errors, omissions or interruptions therein and makes no warranties expressed or implied, as to the performance or results experienced by any party from the use of any information included therein or upon which it is based, and expressly disclaims all warranties of the merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose with respect thereto, and shall not be liable for any claims or losses of any nature in connection with the use of such information, including but not limited to, lost profits or punitive or consequential damages even, if RSBB, LLC is advised of the possibility of same.

Disclaimer

This publication has been prepared by the Corporate and Investment Banking division of Barclays Bank PLC and/or one or more of its affiliates (collectively and each individually, “Barclays”). It has been issued by one or more Barclays legal entities within its Corporate and Investment Banking division as provided below. It is provided to our clients for information purposes only, and Barclays makes no express or implied warranties, and expressly disclaims all warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose or use with respect to any data included in this publication. Barclays will not treat unauthorised recipients of this report as its clients. Prices shown are indicative and Barclays is not offering to buy or sell or soliciting offers to buy or sell any financial instrument. Without prejudice to any of the foregoing and to the extent permitted by law, in no event shall Barclays, nor any affiliate, nor any of their respective officers, directors, partners, or employees have any liability for (a) any special, punitive, indirect, or consequential damages; or (b) any lost profits, lost revenue, loss of anticipated savings or loss of opportunity or other financial loss, even if notified of the possibility of such damages, arising from any use of this publication or its contents.

Other than disclosures relating to Barclays, the information contained in this publication has been obtained from sources that Barclays Research believes to be reliable, but Barclays does not represent or warrant that it is accurate or complete. Barclays is not responsible for, and makes no warranties whatsoever as to, the content of any third-party web site accessed via a hyperlink in this publication and such information is not incorporated by reference.

This publication in the absence of the author(s) and are subject to change, and Barclays has no obligation to update its opinions or the information in this publication. The analyst recommendations in this publication reflect solely and exclusively those of the author(s), and such opinions were prepared independently of any other business, including those of Barclays and for its affiliates. This publication does not constitute personal investment advice or take into account the individual financial circumstances or objectives of the clients who receive it. The securities discussed herein may not be suitable for all investors. Barclays recommends that investors independently evaluate each issuer, security or instrument discussed herein and consult any independent advisors they believe necessary. The value of and income from any investment may fluctuate from day to day as a result of changes in relevant economic markets (including changes in market liquidity). The information herein is not intended to predict actual results, which may differ substantially from those reflected. Past performance is not necessarily indicative of future results.

This communication is being made available in the UK and Europe primarily to persons who are investment professionals as that term is defined in Article 19 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 (Financial Promotion Order) 2005. It is directed at, and therefore should only be relied upon by, persons who have professional experience in matters relating to investments. The investments to which it relates are available only to such person(s) and are not for distribution to or sale to any other person(s) not included in such person(s). Barclays PLC is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and is a member of the London Stock Exchange.

The Corporate and Investment Banking division of Barclays undertakes U.S. securities business in the name of its wholly-owned subsidiary Barclays Capital Inc., a FINRA and SIPC member. Barclays Capital Inc., a U.S. registered broker/dealer, is distributing this material in the United States and, in connection therewith accepts responsibility for its contents. Any U.S. person wishing to effect a transaction in any security discussed herein should do so only by contacting a representative of Barclays Capital Inc. in the U.S. at 745 Seventh Avenue, New York, New York 10019.

Non-U.S. persons should contact and execute transactions through a Barclays Bank PLC branch or affiliate in their home jurisdiction unless local regulations permit otherwise. Barclays Bank PLC, Paris Branch (registered in France under Paris RCS number 381 066 281) is regulated by the Autorité des marchés financiers and the Autorité de contrôle prudentiel. Registered office 34/36 Avenue de Friedland 75008 Paris. This material is distributed in Canada by Barclays Capital Canada Inc., a registered investment dealer and member of IIROC (www.iiroc.ca).

Subject to the conditions of this publication as set out above, Aba Capital, the Investment Banking Division of Aba Bank Limited, an authorised financial services provider (Registration No.: 1986/004794/06. Registered Credit Provider Reg No NCRCP7), is distributing this material in South Africa. Aba Bank Limited is regulated by the South African Reserve Bank. This publication is not, nor is it intended to be, advice as defined and/or contemplated in the (South African) Financial Advisory and Intermediary Services Act, 37 of 2002, or any other financial investment, trading, tax, legal, accounting, retirement, actuarial or other professional advice or service whatsoever. Any person or entity wishing to transact in any security discussed herein should do so only by contacting a representative of Aba Capital in South Africa, 15 Alice Lane, Sandton, Johannesburg, Gauteng 2196. Aba Capital is an affiliate of Barclays.

In Japan, foreign exchange research reports are prepared and distributed in Japan by Barclays Securities Japan Limited. Other research reports are distributed to institutional investors in Japan by Barclays Securities Japan Limited. Barclays Securities Japan Limited is a joint-stock company incorporated in Japan with registered office of 6-10-1 Roppongi, Minato-ku, Tokyo 106-6313. It is a subsidiary of Barclays Bank PLC and a registered financial instruments firm regulated by the Financial Services Agency of Japan. Registered Number: Kanto Zaimyuikokucha (kino) No. 143.

Barclays Bank PLC, Hong Kong Branch is distributing this material in Hong Kong as an authorised institution regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority. Registered Office: 41F, Cheung Kong Center, 2 Queen’s Road Central, Hong Kong.

This material is issued in Taiwan by Barclays Bank Capital Securities Taiwan Limited. This material on securities not traded in Taiwan is not to be construed as ‘recommendation’ in Taiwan. Barclays Capital Securities Taiwan Limited does not accept orders from clients to trade in such securities. This material may not be distributed to the public media or used by the public media without prior written consent of Barclays.

This material is distributed in South Korea by Barclays Capital Securities Limited, Seoul Branch. All equity research reports are issued in India by Barclays Securities (India) Private Limited and SEBI Registration No: INB/INB/2329732 (ISE), INB/INB/01297383 (BSE). Registered Office: 208 (Chesky House) Dr. Annie Besant Road | Shivsagar Estate | Worli | Mumbai - 400 018 | India, Phone: + 91 22 67196363). Other research reports are distributed in India by Barclays Bank PLC, India Branch.

Barclays Bank PLC Frankfurt Branch distributes this material in Germany under the supervision of Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin). This material is distributed in Malaysia by Barclays Capital Markets Malaysia Sdn Bhd.

This material is distributed in Brazil by Banco Barclays S.A.

This material is distributed in Mexico by Banco Barclays Mexico, S.A.

Barclays Bank PLC in the Dubai International Financial Centre (Registered No. DIFC006) is regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (DFSA). Principal place of business in the Dubai International Financial Centre: The Gate Village, Building 4, Level 4, P.O. Box 506504, Dubai, United Arab Emirates. Barclays Bank PLC DIFC Branch, may only underwrite the financial services activities that fall within the scope of its existing DFSA licence. Related Financial Services Authority.

Barclays Bank PLC in the UAE is regulated by the Central Bank of the UAE and is licensed to conduct business activities as a branch of a commercial bank incorporated outside the UAE in Dubai (Licence No.: 13/1844/2008, Registered Office: Building No. 6, Buri Dubai Business Hub, Sheikh Zayed Road, Dubai City) and Abu Dhabi (Licence No.: 13/3952/2008, Registered Office: Al Jazirah Towers, Hamdan Street, PO Box 2734, Abu Dhabi).

Barclays Bank PLC in the Qatar Financial Centre (Registered No. 00108) is authorised by the Qatar Financial Centre Regulatory Authority (QFCRA). Barclays Bank PLC QFIC Branch may only undertake the regulated activities that fall within the scope of its existing QFCRA licence. Principal place of business in Qatar: Qatar Financial Centre, Office 1007, 10th Floor, QFC Tower, Diplomatic Area, West Bay, PO Box 13891, Doha, Qatar. Related financial products or services are only available to Business Customers as defined by the Qatar Financial Centre Regulatory Authority.

This material is distributed in the UAE (including the Dubai International Financial Centre) and Qatar by Barclays Bank Limited.

This material is distributed in Saudi Arabia by Barclays Saudi Arabia (‘BSA’). It is not the intention of the publication to be used or deemed as recommendation, option or advice for any action(s) that may take place in future. Barclays Saudi Arabia is a Closed Joint Stock Company. (CMA License No. 0941-37). Registered office Al Faisaliya Tower, Level 18, Riyadh 11311, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Authorised and regulated by the Capital Market Authority. Commercial Registration Number: 101028824.

This material is distributed in Russia by OOO Barclays Capital, affiliated company of Barclays Bank PLC, registered and regulated in Russia by the FSFM. Broker License No.177-11850-100000, Dealer License No.177-11855-010000. Registered Address in Russia: 125047 Moscow, 1st Tverskaya-Yamskaya str. 21. This material is distributed in Singapore by the Singapore branch of Barclays Bank PLC, a bank licensed in Singapore by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. For matters in connection with this report, recipients in Singapore may contact the Singapore branch of Barclays Bank PLC, whose registered address is One Raffles Quay Level 28, South Tower, Singapore 048583.

Barclays Bank PLC, Australia Branch (ABN 62 064 499 585, AFSL 246617) is distributing this material in Australia. It is directed at ‘wholesale clients’ as defined by Australian Corporations Act 2001. IRS Circular 230 Prepared Materials Disclaimer: Barclays does not provide tax advice and nothing contained herein should be construed to be tax advice. Please be advised that any discussion of U.S. tax matters contained herein (including any attachments) (i) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, by you for the purpose of avoiding U.S. tax-related penalties; and (ii) was written to support the promotion or marketing of the transactions or other matters addressed herein.

Accordingly, you should seek advice based on your particular circumstances from an independent tax advisor.

© Copyright Barclays Bank PLC (2012). All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any manner without the prior written permission of Barclays Bank PLC.

Registered office 1 Churchill Place, London, E14 5HP. Additional information regarding this publication will be furnished upon request.